Journal of Scientific Research and Reports

Volume 30, Issue 6, Page 909-916, 2024; Article no.JSRR.118425
ISSN: 2320-0227

Analysis of Bio- Stimulant Effectiveness for Improved Phenotypic Attributes and Post - Harvest Life of Asiatic Lily cv. Indian Summerset

Prachi Tamrakar [a++*], Urfi Fatmi [a#] and Vijay Bahadur [a†]

[a] Department of Horticulture, Sam Higginbottom University of Agriculture Technology and Sciences, Naini, Prayagraj, India.

Authors' contributions

This work was carried out in collaboration among all authors. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

Article Information

DOI: https://doi.org/10.9734/jsrr/2024/v30i62109

Open Peer Review History:
This journal follows the Advanced Open Peer Review policy. Identity of the Reviewers, Editor(s) and additional Reviewers, peer review comments, different versions of the manuscript, comments of the editors, etc are available here: https://www.sdiarticle5.com/review-history/118425

Original Research Article

Received: 29/03/2024
Accepted: 03/06/2024
Published: 06/06/2024

ABSTRACT

The study was conducted at the Research Farm at Department of Horticulture, Sam Higginbottom University of Agriculture, Technology, and Sciences in Prayagraj during the years 2021-22 and 2022-23. The experiment involved thirteen treatments namely triacontanol at concentrations of 10ppm, 15ppm, 20ppm, and 25ppm, brassinolide at concentrations of 5ppm, 10ppm, 15ppm, and 20ppm and nitrobenzene at concentrations of 100ppm, 200ppm, 300ppm, and 400ppm, organized in Randomized Block Design with three replications. These treatments were applied twice at fifteen-

[++] *Ph.D Scholar;*
[#] *Assistant Professor;*
[†] *Associate Professor;*
**Corresponding author: E-mail: tamrakarp222@gmail.com;*

Cite as: *Tamrakar, Prachi, Urfi Fatmi, and Vijay Bahadur. 2024. "Analysis of Bio- Stimulant Effectiveness for Improved Phenotypic Attributes and Post - Harvest Life of Asiatic Lily Cv. Indian Summerset". Journal of Scientific Research and Reports 30 (6):909-16. https://doi.org/10.9734/jsrr/2024/v30i62109.*

days interval. The result revealed that T_5 - triacontanol @ 25 ppm demonstrated the most favorable outcomes concerning plant height (63.3 cm), number of leaves per plant (62.6), leaf area (14.9 cm^2), and diameter of shoot (12.9 mm) while T_9 - brassinolide @ 20 ppm marked longer vase life (9.8 days).

Keywords: Asiatic lily; flower; bio-stimulants; triacontanol; brassinolide; nitrobenzene.

1. INTRODUCTION

Asiatic lilies are an exquisite choice for cut flowers, offering a stunning array of sizes, shapes, colours along with striking trumpet-shaped blossoms [1]. bio-stimulants have the ability to modify physiological processes in plants, which can play crucial role in enhancing the phenotypic characteristics of Asiatic lilies. Bio-stimulants can be defined as substances and materials that when applied to plants in particular compositions, can alter the physiological processes of plants, offering potential advantages for their growth, development, and responses to stress. They exhibit actions like established plant hormone groups [2] and provide an innovative avenue for regulating and altering physiological processes in plants, with the aim of stimulating growth, alleviating the constraints imposed by various biotic and abiotic stress, and ultimately boosting crop quality and yield. Triacontanol, brassinolide and nitrobenzene positively influence the growth and development of plants [3,4]. Triacontanol is a potential bio-stimulant. It can effectively improve various physiological parameters of Asiatic lily by influencing the metabolism of plant [5,6]. Brassinolide is steroidal compound which acts as a vital molecule within the plant part for growth as well as development of Asiatic lily. Brassinolide are known as sixth-generation plant hormones [7-10]. Nitrobenzene can be described as a pale-yellow oil which have almond-like odour. Flowering crops have been known to respond well to nitrobenzene, as in past, Nitrobenzene has improved the flowering attributes in many plants. Nitrobenzene are new generation plant growth promoter which have crucial role in energizing flowering stimulant and enhancing the yield [11].

2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

The research was carried out during 2021-22 and 2022-23 at Horticulture Research Farm, Department of Horticulture, Naini Agricultural Institute, Sam Higginbottom University of Agriculture Technology and Sciences, Naini, Prayagraj. The experiment compromised of thirteen treatments which were replicated thrice. The treatments were T_1- Control, T_2- 10 ppm Triacontanol, T_3-15 ppm Triacontanol, T_4-20 ppm Triacontanol, T_5- 25 ppm Triacontanol, T_6- 5 ppm Brassinolide, T_7-10 ppm Brassinolide, T_8-15 ppm Brassinolide, T_9-20 ppm Brassinolide, T_{10}-100 ppm Nitrobenzene, T_{11}- 200 ppm Nitrobenzene, T_{12}-300 ppm Nitrobenzene, T_{13}-400 ppm Nitrobenzene. Application of bio-stimulants were done two times. The first application was done after fifteen days of planting.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 Plant Height

After 40 days of planting significantly taller plants (45.7 cm) were reported in T_5 (triacontanol at the rate of 25 ppm) which was found to be at par with T_4, (triacontanol at the rate of 20 ppm, 43.4 cm), T_9 (brassinolide at the rate of 20 ppm, 43.2 cm) while T_1 (control,) reported significantly shorter plants (34.6 cm). 60 days after planting, similar results with respect to plant height were obtained, T_5 (triacontanol at the rate of 25 ppm) reported significantly taller plants (63.3cm) which was followed by (triacontanol at the rate of 20 ppm, 58.0 cm) whereas T_1 (control reported significantly shorter plants (47.9 cm). The observed increase in plant height can be attributed to the rapid translocation of triacontanol, facilitating the formation of L adenosine. This, in turn, triggered signals throughout the plant, leading to increased apoplastic ion concentration within stem tissues, promoting shoot development and elongation and consequently increasing plant height [12]. These findings align with previous research by Koley et al. [13] in gladiolus and Naeem et al. [14] in periwinkle, further supporting the efficacy of triacontanol and bio-stimulants in enhancing plant growth and development.

Table 1. Response of bio-stimulants on Plant height and number of leaves per plant in Asiatic lily plants

	Plant height (cm)						Number of leaves per plant					
	2021-22		2022-2023		Pooled data		2021-22		2022-2023		Pooled data	
Treatment	**40 days**	**60 days**	**40 days**	**60 days**	**40 days**	**60 days**	**40 days**	**60 days**	**40 days**	**60 days**	**40 days**	**60 days**
T_1- Control	33.2	46.9	36.0	47.9	34.6	47.4	41.3	48.3	39.1	50.7	40.2	49.5
T_2- 10 ppm Triacontanol	39.1	49.7	39.4	56.0	39.2	53.5	47.8	54.4	52.1	53.7	50.0	54.0
T_3-15 ppm Triacontanol	40.0	52.7	40.9	56.5	40.6	55.3	49.9	59.3	48.8	57.1	49.3	58.2
T_4-20 ppm Triacontanol	42.8	56.9	44.0	59.8	43.4	58.0	54.1	61.3	56.8	59.3	55.5	59.7
T_5- 25 ppm Triacontanol	44.8	59.9	49.9	64.1	45.7	63.3	56.7	62.9	57.0	62.5	56.9	62.6
T_6- 5 ppm Brassinolide	38.8	50.8	37.3	52.0	38.4	51.4	48.3	56.0	44.4	57	46.4	57.2
T_7-10 ppm Brassinolide	40.0	52.1	37.9	53.3	39.1	52.7	49.7	56.5	45.3	57.1	47.5	58.1
T_8-15 ppm Brassinolide	41.4	54.7	39.6	55.2	40.5	54.9	50.3	58.3	45.9	55.4	48.1	57.4
T_9-20 ppm Brassinolide	42.0	56.6	43.0	56.3	43.2	56.5	52.7	61.0	52.6	56.6	52.7	58.0
T_{10}-100 ppm Nitrobenzene	34.6	49.4	36.7	51.2	35.6	50.3	43.3	50.3	42.2	55.4	42.7	52.9
T_{11}- 200 ppm Nitrobenzene	36.6	51.0	38.8	51.3	37.7	51.1	44.9	51.9	43.6	57.0	44.2	54.6
T_{12}-300 ppm Nitrobenzene	38.3	52.4	40.0	51.8	39.2	52.1	46.0	54.9	43.4	57.2	44.7	57.1
T_{13}- 400 ppm Nitrobenzene	37.6	53.3	40.9	52.1	39.3	52.7	47.0	56.3	46.2	57.4	46.6	56.5
F- test	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**
S. Ed (±)	2.220	2.695	2.774	3.742	1.572	2.259	3.006	3.020	1.956	2.630	1.940	1.000
$CD_{0.05}$	4.583	5.564	5.727	7.486	3.246	4.663	6.206	6.233	4.039	5.430	4.004	1.983
CV	6.92	6.25	7.87	8.16	4.84	5.14	6.54	6.56	4.79	5.52	4.98	2.05

Table 2. Response of bio-stimulants on the leaf area and diameter of shoot in Asiatic lily plants

	Leaf area (cm^2)						Diameter of shoot (mm)					
	2021-22		2022-2023		Pooled data		2021-22		2022-2023		Pooled data	
Treatment	**40 days**	**60 days**	**40 days**	**60 days**	**40 days**	**60 days**	**40 days**	**60 days**	**40 days**	**60 days**	**40 days**	**60 days**
T_1- Control	7.2	10.3	7.9	10.2	7.6	10.3	6.4	9.0	6.1	9.7	6.14	9.4
T_2- 10 ppm Triacontanol	9.3	11.3	8.8	12.4	9.1	11.8	7.5	11.0	8.0	11.8	7.24	11.4
T_3-15 ppm Triacontanol	9.4	11.5	8.9	12.5	9.2	12.0	8.2	11.4	8.2	12.5	7.89	12.0
T_4-20 ppm Triacontanol	10.8	13.6	9.5	13.3	10.1	13.4	8.5	11.9	8.6	13.0	8.43	12.2
T_5- 25 ppm Triacontanol	12.0	14.4	10.7	15.7	11.3	14.9	8.9	12.9	9.1	13.6	8.86	12.9
T_6- 5 ppm Brassinolide	8.4	12.3	8.7	12.2	8.5	12.2	7.6	10.6	7.5	11.5	8.23	11.1
T_7-10 ppm Brassinolide	8.8	12.4	8.7	12.3	8.8	12.4	7.8	10.9	7.7	11.9	7.68	11.4
T_8-15 ppm Brassinolide	9.3	13.2	8.9	12.3	9.1	12.7	7.9	11.1	7.9	12.1	7.88	11.6
T_9-20 ppm Brassinolide	9.9	13.3	9.3	12.8	9.6	13.0	8.3	11.3	8.1	12.6	8.06	12.3
T_{10}-100 ppm Nitrobenzene	8.2	11.8	8.3	11.7	8.2	11.8	6.6	9.9	6.8	10.2	7.62	10.1
T_{11}- 200 ppm Nitrobenzene	8.1	12.0	8.5	11.6	8.3	11.8	6.5	10.2	7.1	10.7	6.91	10.5
T_{12}-300 ppm Nitrobenzene	8.5	12.2	8.7	12.1	8.6	12.2	7.4	10.4	7.3	11.3	6.99	10.9
T_{13}- 400 ppm Nitrobenzene	8.8	12.6	9.2	12.5	9.0	12.6	7.7	11.3	7.8	12.2	7.65	11.8
F- test	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**	**S**
S. Ed (±)	0.656	0.719	0.633	0.938	0.463	0.558	0.466	0.74	0.56	0.695	0.293	0.436
$CD_{0.05}$	1.354	1.484	1.308	1.937	0.957	1.153	0.962	1.527	1.157	1.435	0.606	0.900
CV	8.75	7.15	8.64	9.20	6.26	5.52	7.43	8.29	8.9	7.25	4.70	4.70

Table 3. Effect of bio-stimulants on vase Life in Asiatic lily plants

	Vase life		
Treatment	**2021-22**	**2022-23**	**Pooled data**
T_1- Control	6.6	7.1	6.8
T_2- 10 ppm Triacontanol	6.7	7.4	7.1
T_3-15 ppm Triacontanol	7.7	7.9	7.8
T_4-20 ppm Triacontanol	7.7	8.0	7.8
T_5- 25 ppm Triacontanol	8.7	8.9	8.8
T_6- 5 ppm Brassinolide	7.9	8.1	8.0
T_7-10 ppm Brassinolide	8.7	8.5	8.6
T_8-15 ppm Brassinolide	9. 1	9. 7	9.4
T_9-20 ppm Brassinolide	9.8	9.9	9.8
T_{10}-100ppm Nitrobenzene	8.6	8.6	8.6
T_{11}- 200 ppm Nitrobenzene	8.0	8.4	8.2
T_{12}-300ppm Nitrobenzene	8 .7	9. 2	9.0
T_{13}- 400 ppm Nitrobenzene	9. 1	9. 1	9.1
F-test	**S**	**S**	**S**
S. Ed (±)	0.375	0.493	0.385
$CD_{0.05}$	0.775	1 .018	0.795
CV	5.57	7.09	5.63

3.2 Number of Leaves

After 40 days of planting, significantly more number of leaves per plant (56.9) were reported in T_5 (triacontanol at the rate of 25 ppm) which was found to be at par with T_4 (triacontanol at the rate of 20 ppm, 55.5) while T_1 (control) reported significantly lesser number of leaf (40.2). 60 days after planting, similar results with respect to number of leaves per plant (62.6) were reported in T_5 (triacontanol at the rate of 25 ppm) which was at par with T_9 (brassinolide at the rate of 20 ppm, 62.0) whereas T_1 (control) reported significantly lesser number of leaves per plant (49.5). More number of leaves in triacontanol treated plants might be attributed to its role in increasing stomatal conductance and net photosynthesis of the plant. photosynthetic capacity depends on photosynthetic pigment capacity such as accrual of chlorophyll (a, b and a+b) which is induced significantly with application of triacontanol. All these traits significantly influence the internal fixation of CO_2 in the mesophyll tissue thus elevating the number of leaves [15]. Triacontanol positively influences the number of leaf and nodes of *Capsicum frutscens* [16]. Muthuchelian et al*.* [17] also discussed positive relation with triacontanol in increasing the integration of chlorophyll a and b along with CO_2 assimilation in Indian coral tree. Similar findings were reported by Bhandari et al*.* [18] in kohlrabi, Koley et al*.* [13] in gladiolus and Moorthy and Kathiresan, 1993 in mangrove.

3.3 Leaf Area

After 40 days of planting significantly bigger leaf area (11.3 cm^2) were reported in T_5 (triacontanol at the rate of 25 ppm) followed by T_4 (triacontanol at the rate of 20 ppm, 10.1 cm^2), while T_1 (control) reported significantly shorter leaf area. (7.6 cm^2). 60 days after planting, similar results with respect to leaf area were obtained, T_5 (triacontanol at the rate of 25 ppm) reported significantly higher leaf area (14.9 cm^2) which was followed by T_4 (triacontanol at the rate of 15 ppm, 13.4 cm^2) whereas T_1 (control) reported significantly smaller leaf area (10.3cm^2). Triacontanol application is involved in stimulation of calcium, magnesium and potassium by elication of the messenger adenosine. The elevation in the mineral content of plant may be responsible for the increase in blade length, epidermal cells and chlorophyll which have accounted for increased leaf area [19]. Triacontanol have positive effect on leaf area and bract growth of bougainvillea [20]. These are in conformity with the findings of Skogen et al*.* [21] in chrysanthemum, Mallick et al*.* [22] in potato and Reddy et al*.* [16] in capsicum.

3.4 Diameter of Shoot

After 40 days of planting significantly larger diameter of shoot (8.8 mm) were reported in T_5 (triacontanol at the rate of 25 ppm) which was found to be at par with T_4 (8.4 mm, triacontanol at the rate of 20 ppm), while T_1 (control) reported significantly shorter diameter of shoot (6.1 mm). 60 days after planting, similar results with respect to diameter of shoot were obtained, T_5 (triacontanol at the rate of 25 ppm) reported significantly larger diameter (12.9 mm) which was at par with T_9 (brassinolide at the rate of 20 ppm, 12.3 mm), T_4 (triacontanol at the rate of 20 ppm, 12.2 mm) whereas T_1 (control) reported significantly smaller diameter (9.4 mm). The increase in diameter of shoot may be due to the fact that triacontanol is linked with the rbc*S* gene levels which helps in increment of the activity of photosynthesis and also improves the status of photosystems which is involved in enhancing water absorption, promoting cell division and elongation, along with improving cell membrane permeability which ultimately increased the girth of the shoot [23]. Application of triacontanol has a positive role in increasing the shoot development of the plant [24,]. Triacontanol increased the height and leaf area in tomato plants [25]. These are in conformity with the findings of Naeem et al*.* [19] in mint and karam and keramat [26] in coriander.

3.5 Vase Life

Longer vase life (9.8 days) reported in T_9 (brassinolide at the rate of 20 ppm) which was followed by T_8 (brassinolide at the rate of 15ppm, 9.4 days) while T_1 (control) reported significantly shorter vase life (6.8 days). Brassinolides have the potential to improve leaf water use efficiency by influencing the carbon capture by Rubisco enzyme along with maintaining the permeability of plasma membrane [27]. Another reason could be that respiration rate is inhibited by application of brassinolide along with enhancing the anti-oxidant capacity. Hence, brassinolide application lead to decline in ethylene production increasing post - harvest life of the flower [28]. These findings are in support with Kuri et al*.* [29] in china aster.

4. CONCLUSION

On the basis of experimental findings it was concluded that treatment T_5 - triacontanol at the rate of 25 ppm was found most suitable in respect to plant height, number of leaves per plant, leaf area and diameter of shoot while T_9 - brassinolide at the rate of 20 ppm reported longer vase life.

COMPETING INTERESTS

Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

REFERENCES

1. Dole JM, Harold F, Wilkins P. Floriculture Principles and Species. Prentice Hall Inc, Upper Saddle River, New Jersey: 613.International Journal of Botany Studies. 1999;4(2):421-426.
2. Yaronskaya E, Vershilovskaya I. Poers Y, Alawady AE, Averina N, Grimm B. Bio-stimulants effects on biosynthesis and photosynthetic activity in barley seedlings. Journal of Experimental Botany. 2006;22 (4):700-709.
3. Kuri BR, Jat NL, Shivran AC, Saharawat YS, Dadarwal RS. Effect of sowing time, varieties and plant growth, physiological indices and productivity of coriander (*Coriandrum sativum)*. Indian Journal of Agronomy. 2015;60(3): 464-470.
4. Moorthy P, Kathiresan K. Physiological responses of mangrove seedling to triacontanol. Biologia Plantarum. 1993;35 (4): 577-581.
5. Kumar D, Baghel D, Banwasi R, Singh AK, Soni R. Effect of Cell Free Microbial Bio-Stimulant on Growth, Yield and the Microbial Activity of Tomato (*Solanum lycopersicum* L.) Grown in Vertisol. J. Exp. Agric. Int. 2023;45(8):90-6. Available:https://journaljeai.com/index.php/JEAI/article/view/2160 [Accessed on: 2024 May 30]
6. Singh A, Shah HP, Patel GD, Ahlawat TR. Effect of Foliar Spray of Polyamines and Biostimulants on Rose (*Rosa hybrida* L.) under Polyhouse Condition. Curr. J. Appl. Sci. Technol. 2022];41(31):14-22. Available:https://journalcjast.com/index.php/CJAST/article/view/3936 [Accessed on 2024 May 30]
7. Parađiković N, Teklić T, Zeljković S, Lisjak M, Špoljarević M. Biostimulants research in some horticultural plant species—A review. Food and Energy Security. 2019;8(2): e00162.
8. Khripach V, Zhabinskii V, Groot A. Twenty years of brassinosteroid: Steroidal plant hormones warrant better crops for the XXI century. Annals of Botany. 2000;86:441-447.
9. Muthuchelian KC, Murugan N, Nedunchezhian D, Kulandaivelu G. Photosynthesis and growth of *Erythrina variegata* as affected by water stress and triacontanol. Photosynthetica. 1997;33(2): 241-248.
10. Yakhin OI, Lubyanov AA, Yakhin IA, Brown PH. Bio-stimulants in plant science: A global perspective. Frontiers in Plant Science. 2017;7(2):1-32.
11. Aziz MA. Miah MA. Effect of flora on the growth and yield of wetland rice. Journal of Agricultural Research and Development. 2009;12(1):112-120.
12. Ries S, Wert V, Leary D, Nair M. Adenosine: a new naturally occurring plant growth substance elicited by triacontanol in rice. Plant Growth Regulation. 1990;9:263-273.
13. Koley P, Maitra S, Sarkar I. Studies on the exogenous application of plant growth regulators on morphological and biochemical changes in gladiolus (*Gladiolus grandiflorus*) Leaf. International Journal of Current Microbiology and Applied Sciences. 2019;8 (9):1869-1877.
14. Naeem M., Ansari AA, Aftab T, Shabbir A. Application of triacontanol modulates plant growth and physiological activities of *Catharanthus roseus* L; 2019.
15. Ivanov AG, Angelov MN. Photosynthesis response to triacontanol correlates with increased dynamics of mesophyll protoplast and chloroplast membranes, Plant Growth Regulation. 1997;21(2):145-152.
16. Reddy BO, Giridhar P, Ravishankar GA. The effect of triacontanol on micropropagation of *Capsicum frutescens* and *Decalepis hamiltonii*. Plant Cell, Tissue and Organ Culture. 2002;71(3): 253-258.
17. Muthuchelian K. Bertamini M, Namachevayam N. Triacontanol can protect *Erythrin* from cadmium toxicity. Journal of Plant Physiology. 2001;158(11):1487-1490.

18. Bhandari S, Bhandari A, Shrestha J. Effect of different doses of triacontanol on growth and yield of kohlrabi (*Brassica oleraceae var gonglylodes*). Plant Physiology Plant Molecular Biology. 2021;49(1): 427-432.
19. Naeem MM, Khan MA, Moinuddin M, Idrees M, Aftab T. Triacontanol mediated regulation of growth and other physiological attributes, active constituents and yield of *Mentha arvensis.* Plant Growth Regulation. 2011;65(1):195-206.
20. Khandeker MM, Faruq G, Rahman M, Azirun MS, Boyce AN. Potted bougainvillea plants (*Bougainvillea glabra* var. Elizabeth Angus) under natural conditions. The Scientific World Journal. 2013;12 (7):156-162.
21. Skogen D, Eriksen AB, Nilsen S. Effect of triacontanol on production and quality of flowers of *Chrysanthemum moriolium*. Scientia Horticulturae. 1982;18 (1):87-92.
22. Mallick S, Ghosh RK, Pal D. Effect of triacontanol on the growth and yield of potato. Journal of Crop and Weed. 2009;5(2):154-156.
23. Borowski E, Blamowski ZK. The effects of triacontanol 'TRIA' and Asahi SL on the development and metabolic activity of sweet basil (*Ocimum basilicum*) plants treated with chilling. Acta Horticulture. 2009;21(1):39-48.
24. Naeem MM, Khan A, Moinuddin AS. Triacontanol: A potent plant growth regulator in agriculture. Journal of Plant Interactions. 2012;7(2):129-142.
25. Khan M, Aftab M, Naeem M. Synergistic effects of gibberellic acid and triacontanol growth, physiology, enzyme activities and essential oil content of *Coriandrum sativum* L. The Asian and Australian Journal of Plant Science and Biotechnology. 2010; 4(1):24-29.
26. Karam EA, Keramat B. Foliar spray of triacontanol improves growth by alleviating oxidative damage in coriander under salinity. Indian Journal of Plant Physiology. 2017;22(1):301-308.
27. Tanveer M, Shahzad B, Sharma A, Biju S. 24-Epibrassinolide; an active brassinolide and its role in salt stress tolerance in plants. Plant Physiology and Biochemistry. 2018;3:130-133.
28. Zheng L, Ma J, Li Z, Gao C, Zhang, Zhao C. Revealing critical mechanisms of BR-mediated apple nursery tree growth using iTRAQ-based proteomic analysis. Journal of Proteom. 2018;17(3):139-154.
29. Kuri S, Bahadur V, Prasad VM, Bander AN, Niranjan R. Effect of plant growth regulators on vegetative, floral and yield characters of China aster. (*Callistephus chinensis*) cv. Phule Ganesh Purple. International Journal of Chemical Studies. 2018;6(4):3165-3169.

Peer-review history:
The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here:
https://www.sdiarticle5.com/review-history/118425